



印尼华人研究国际会议  
INTERNATIONAL  
CONFERENCE ON  
CHINESE INDONESIAN  
STUDIES 2015



# PROCEEDING

## The 2nd International Conference on Chinese Indonesian Studies

印尼华裔研究国际会议

THEME :

**CHINESE DIASPORA TRADITION  
IN INDONESIA NATION BUILDING:  
CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES**

ORGANIZED BY :



UNIVERSITAS  
KRISTEN  
MARANATHA

SUPPORTED BY :



**PROCEEDING**

**The 2nd International Conference on  
Chinese Indonesian Studies 2015**

**Theme:**

**Chinese Diaspora Tradition in Indonesia Nation Building:  
Challenges and Opportunities**

Bandung, 5-6th February 2015

MUP  
MARANATHA UNIVERSITY PRESS



## **PROCEEDING**

**The 2nd International Conference on Chinese Indonesian Studies 2015.**

**Theme: Chinese Diaspora Tradition in Indonesia Nation Building: Challenges and Opportunities.**

Editor: Dr. Teresa Liliana Wargasetia, S.Si., M.Kes., PA(K).

Desain Cover & Layout : Roy Anthonius Susanto., S.Sn., M.Ds.

Penerbit:

Maranatha University Press (MUP)

Jl. Prof. Drg. Suria Sumantri, MPH No. 65

Bandung 40164

Cetakan pertama, 2015.

Hak cipta dilindungi undang-undang.

Perpustakaan Nasional: Katalog Dalam Terbitan (KDT).

Proceeding the 2nd International Conference on Chinese Indonesian Studies 2015.

Theme: Chinese Diaspora Tradition in Indonesia Nation Building: Challenges and Opportunities/

editor Dr. Teresa Liliana Wargasetia, S.Si., M.Kes., PA(K).

Bandung, MUP, 2015, 315 hlm, 21 × 29,7 cm.

ISBN 978-602-72127-0-1.



## **BOARD OF COMMITTEE**

**Prof. Dr. Ir. Benjamin Soenarko, MSME**  
(Maranatha Christian University)

**Dr. Ir. Sugiri Kustedja, MT.**  
(Maranatha Christian University)

**Prof. Esther H. Kuntjara.**  
(Petra Christian University)

**Dr. Setefanus Suprajitno.**  
(Petra Christian University)

**B. Danang Setianto, SH., LL.M, MIL**  
(Soegijapranata Catholic University)

**Dr. Tyas Susanti**  
(Soegijapranata Catholic University)

**Prof. Nie De Ning**  
(Xiamen University)

**Prof. Shi Xueqin**  
(Xiamen University)



## ORGANIZING COMMITTEE

Advisor	Ir. Yusak Gunadi Santoso, MM (Rektor UKM) Ir. Hanny Juliani Dani, MT (Pembantu Rektor III UKM) Prof. Dr. dr. Susy Tjahjani, M.Kes. (Ketua LPPM UKM)
Chairman	Dr. Krismanto Kusbiantoro, S.T., M.T.
1st Secretary	Elizabeth Wianto, S.Sos., S.Sn., M.Ds.
2nd Secretary	Citra Amelia, S.Sn., MFA
Administration	Gun Gun
1st Treasurer	Dr. dr Hana Ratnawati, M.Kes, PA(K)
2nd Treasurer	Dr. Teresa L. Wargasetia, S.Si., M.Kes, PA(K)
Proceeding Coordinator	Dr. Teresa L. Wargasetia, S.Si., M.Kes, PA(K)
Reviewer Coordinator	Dr. Ir. Sugiri Kustedja, M.T.
Design & Publication	Roy Anthonius Susanto, S.Sn., M.Ds.
Hospitality & Accomodation	Prasastri Tria Danarti, BA
Documentation Coordinator	Iwan Santosa, S.T.
Venue Coordinator	Drs. Alexandrey Mangundjojo
Event Organizer	Irena V.G Fajarto, S.T., M.Comm.
Session Coordinator	Liem Boen Hong, M.T.
Moderator Coordinator	Pauw Budianto, M. Lit.
Workshop Coordinator	Isabella Isthipraya Andreas, M.Ds.
Field Trip Coordinator	Erwin Ardianto Halim, S.Sn., MFA
Cathering	Dr. Dra. Seriwati Ginting, M.Pd.



## Prolog

### Chinese Diaspora Tradition in Indonesia Nation Building Challenges & Opportunities

The existence of Chinese Indonesian can never be removed from the whole Indonesia nation building. Since the reformation era, the existence of Chinese Indonesian ethnicity with all its cultural attribute are clearly expressed after a long hibernation during the former governance. This is a good opportunity for scholars, leaders, engineers, physicists, economist, artist, lawyers, even politicians to develop studies about Chinese Indonesian's ethnicity and all their aspects, including their local tradition.

More than thirty years of hibernation had caused discontinuity of tradition. Many Chinese Indonesian local tradition vanished because

---

*Many Chinese Indonesian local  
tradition vanished because it was no  
longer passed to the younger  
generation*

---

The inevitable pressure of modernity and globalization is a great challenge for the late Chinese Indonesian local tradition to bloom. Yet this condition initiate the opportunity of revitalization and redevelopment of Chinese Indonesian local tradition. The issue is that how do we have to respond such condition? The response might be to rejuvenate and enliven the old local tradition, or to create a new culture that still adopt the past tradition but facilitate current context. Moreover, the issue grows to the position of such contribution in Indonesia

nation building.

This conference aims to recognize Chinese Indonesian local tradition, to identify challenges and search opportunities in order to blend those valuable tradition as inseparable part of Chinese Indonesian ethnicity as part of the whole nation building. This living tradition of Chinese Indonesian gathers many living aspect tradition including thinking, ritual, sociological, language, architecture, law, business, political and many more.

The conference will be followed by an optional filed trip to Cirebon area. This field trip be conducted after the conference as an optional program. It is a 3-days and 2-night program, travel by train to Cirebon and bus for city tour in Cirebon area. Cirebon is an old city at the seashore with many Chinese dwelling artifacts, historical Chinese temples, Old Sultanate Kraton (palace), Markets. Where part of city old area demolished by the current economic development, quickly pushed out the existing cultural heritages. A suburb of depleted China town Jamblang will be visited with their old houses, together with Trusmi nearby batik village.



## Chairman's Message

Dear honored guest, welcome to Maranatha Christian University for the 2nd International Conference on Chinese Indonesian Studies.

It is a privilege to welcome you to this event.

After the successful 1st conference in Semarang almost 2 years ago, many researches and discourses about the life of the Chinese Indonesian emerged as a trending topics among scholars in Indonesia and many other countries. This particular subject has raised a wide spectrum of issues that requires comprehensive studies and involves multidisciplinary approaches.

The 2nd international conference on Chinese Indonesian will focus of the issue of the Chinese Diaspora tradition in the context of the Indonesia's nation building. It is undeniable that Chinese Diaspora tradition has become part of the hybrid Indonesian culture. It has become a significant ingredient of the whole Indonesia's nation building that covers so many living aspect. The purpose of the conference is to identify and explore the Chinese Diaspora tradition in Indonesia in order to understand the particular position in the the process of the nation building, and also to conserve and nurture the traditions for the young generations.

To all supporting institution and board of committee from Xiamen University, Petra Christian University, Soegijapranata Catholic University and Tarumanagara University, we would like to send you our great gratitude for such a support and commitment. To all the presenters and participant, thank you very much for participating in this event. Thank you for sharing your ideas and hopefully you can enjoy the whole conference.

On behalf of all the organizing committee, I would like to apologize for all inconvenience that may occurs before, during and after the conference.

Have a nice stay in Bandung and enjoy the conference.

Dr. Krismanto Kusbiantoro., S.T, M.T.  
Chairman of Organizing Committee



UNIVERSITAS  
KRISTEN  
MARANATHA



## Rector's Message

Our gratitude to our loving God for His grace that enable us to gather in this special event:  
International Conference on Chinese Indonesian Studies 2nd held on 5-6 February 2015.

We welcome you to our campus, Universitas Kristen Maranatha, with hope that all participants are in good condition. First of all we would like to thank those who have supported this event so that the seminar could be held properly. We do appreciate it.

As we know that many Indonesian Chinese local traditions disappear because they are no longer passed on from generation to generation. This process also occurs due to the challenges of globalization as well as ongoing modernization.

This is a challenge for us, how to respond back the existed local tradition or creating a new tradition that still adopt a long-standing tradition in which we also have to focus on to the whole process of nation and state in Indonesia.

We wish this seminar would give beneficial to all participants.

Ir. Yusak Gunadi Santoso, MM.  
Rector  
Universitas Kristen Maranatha



## TABLE OF CONTENT

Board of Committee	i
Organizing Committee	ii
Prolog	iii
Chairman's Messages	iv
Rector's Messages	v
Table of Content	vi
 The Way to Integration: Comment of Minggu Chiao Hsing on Chinese Indonesian Issues Shi Xueqin	 1
 Adakah "Republik" Lan Fang Kongsu di Kalimantan Barat? Sugiri Kustedja	 12
 Prospect of Chinese Indonesian Studies Esther Kuntjara	 22
 Budaya Tionghoa di Dalam Budaya Indonesia: Kasus Sekolah Terpadu Pahoa Dali Santun Naga	 27
 Perbandingan Gaya Visual Batik Trusmi Cirebon dengan Batik Pekalongan yang Didasari oleh Perbedaan Citarasa Ariesa Pandanwangi, Christine Claudia Lukman, Yasraf Amir Piliang	 31
 The Resistance of Female Characters in "Gelang Giok Naga" Resti Nurfaidah	 42
 Komunitas "Tionghoa-Gorontalo": Satu Negeri-Dua Generasi-Dua Wajah Hendri Gunawan	 52
 Perkembangan Agama Tao di Indonesia Ardian Cangianto	 61
 Becoming Indonesia: Hindrances and Opportunities of Social and Cultural Interaction of the Chinese - Javanese in Semarang's Chinatown Adrianus L.G. Waworuntu, Fuad Gani	 75
 Kehidupan Kelompok Etnis Tionghoa Bekasi Dewi Hartati	 89
 "Ketika Naga dan Singa Menari dengan Banteng" Pelestarian Tarian Barongsai dan Liong di Bantengan Malang Hanifati A. Radhia, Rizki Pradestiyan Putra, Ary Budiyanto	 95

Antara Agama 'Baru' dan Tradisi 'Kuno' Refleksi Dua Keluarga Tionghoa dari Jawa Timur Studi Autoetnografi Kemuning L. Pharamasantati, Yessica C. Hidayat, Ary Budiyanto	105
Babah dalam Birokrasi: Jaringan Opsir Tionghoa di Jawa Abad XIX Priyanto Wibowo	115
Karya Sastra Pengarang Tionghoa-Indonesia: Masa Soeharto dan Reformasi Nurni W. Wuryandari	125
Pengaruh Interaksi Citarasa dan Gaya Hidup pada Desain Kartu Undangan Pernikahan Tionghoa di Bandung Tahun 2013 Christine Claudia Lukman, Priyanto Sunarto, Yasraf Amir Piliang	133
Mengkaji Kehidupan Sosial Budaya Masyarakat Turunan China Di Indonesia (Suatu Tinjauan dari Sosiologi) Seriwati Ginting	144
Fashion Carnaval Isu Revitalisasi Lokalitas Budaya Tionghoa Indonesia di Jember Lois Denissa, Pribadi Widodo, Nuning Yanti Damayanti Adisasmito, Yasraf Amir Piliang	151
The Taman Budaya Tionghoa at the Taman Mini Indonesia Indah Myra Sidharta	162
Contribution of the Chinese Indonesians to the Indonesian Culture in the Context of Regional Diversity Dobrochna Olszewska	168
Beliefs and Religions Practices of Chinese Families in Java Aji 'Chen' Bromokusumo	178
The Flux of Chinese Architectural Diaspora in 19th Century through an Architectural Comparative Study of the Oldest Teochew Temple in Senggarang, Tanjung Pinang, Indonesia and Singapore Yeo Kang Shua	188
"Pelangi Budaya" an Opportunity in Education to Develop an Inclusive Nation Building Mosaic Christine Edith Pheeney	202
Jakarta's Chinese Temples until 1949: Socio-Cultural Sites Greysia Susilo Junus	211
Documents on the Life of Ko Ho Sing (1825-1900) Willem Van Der Molen	224

Watching Chinese Indonesians through the Lens of Camera

Setefanus Suprajitno

234

Ca Bau Kan: The Problematic Centralizing of the Marginalized  
Anton Sutandio

243

Legacy of Zheng He's Voyages:  
The Inclusive Nature of Chinese-Indonesian Muslims Since 2003  
Yu Hao Wen

250

印度尼西亚东爪哇华人企业家积极和坚韧不拔  
之奋斗精神表现  
Ong Mia Farao Karsono, Widjojo Suprpto

257

荷印时期巴达维亚华人的“大好日”  
——以吧城华人公馆（吧国公堂）档案资料为中心  
Nie De Ning

261

华校万隆中华中小学华语文教育发展趋势  
Chang Jemima

273

印尼爪哇岛三大城市华人的文化认同现状研究-----  
基于《印度尼西亚华人文化认同情况》的结果分析  
Zhang Xiao Qian

282

泗水华人取名与身份认同  
Budi Kurniawan

Khasanah Sastra Jawa-Cina  
Dwi Woro Retno Mastuti

Hubungan Pembelajaran Bahasa Mandarin dengan Identitas Mahasiswa Keturunan  
Tionghoa di Surabaya  
Lu Li Qian Qian





MARANATHA  
CHRISTIAN  
UNIVERSITY



印尼华人研究国际会议  
INTERNATIONAL  
CONFERENCE ON  
CHINESE INDONESIAN  
STUDIES 2015

# CERTIFICATE

THIS IS TO CERTIFY THAT

**Setefanus Suprajitno, Ph.D**

HAS ATTENDED

THE 2ND INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON CHINESE INDONESIAN STUDIES  
THEME: CHINESE DIASPORA TRADITION IN INDONESIA NATION BUILDING:  
CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES  
AT BANDUNG, INDONESIA - FEBRUARY 5TH – 6TH 2015

AS

PRESENTER

Institute of Research and Community Services  
Maranatha Christian University  
**Prof. Dr. Susy Tjahjani, dr., M.Kes.**

Chairman of Organizing Committee  
**Dr. Krismanto Kusbiantoro, S.T, M.T.**



# Watching Chinese Indonesians through the Lens of Camera

SETEFANUS SUPRAJITNO

*Center for Chinese Indonesian Studies, Petra Christian University*

*Siwalankerto 121-131, Surabaya, 60236, Indonesia*

*Email: [steph@petra.ac.id](mailto:steph@petra.ac.id)*

## ABSTRACT

Life narratives have been the object of anthropological studies for decades, as they are used for understanding societies and cultures. While the common method for studying them has been ethnographic research techniques, some scholars have proposed that photography and pictures can be used as a tool in doing the life narratives. This idea finds support in the field of visual anthropology, in which photo-elicitation techniques are mostly used in data collection. In this paper, I use a collection of photographs taken from 1972 to 2001 by Paul Piollet – an enthusiast photographer who has travelled extensively in Indonesia – as as a cultural inventory of the lives of Chinese Indonesians. Drawing from the disciplines of anthropology, I discuss how the lives of Chinese Indonesians are far from the stereotypical portrayal of the Chinese, which was prevalent during the New Order era and to certain extent still exists today. I show how these photographs expose the “unseen colors” of the lives of the Chinese in Indonesia, that is, the lives that the Indonesian society may not relate to the Chinese because they are the everyday life of ordinary people in Indonesia.

## KEY WORDS

**Chinese Indonesian, photography, life narrative, prejudice, stereotypes**

## ABSTRAK

Selama puluhan tahun, kisah kehidupan telah menjadi objek kajian antropologi. Hal ini terjadi karena kisah kehidupan itu dapat digunakan untuk memahami masyarakat dan budaya. Selama ini, metode yang umumnya digunakan adalah metode penelitian etnografis. Namun demikian beberapa pakar berpendapat bahwa foto juga dapat digunakan sebagai alat untuk mengkaji kisah kehidupan tersebut. Pendapat ini didukung oleh kajian dalam bidang antropologi visual, yang menggunakan tehnik *photo-elicitation* dalam proses pengumpulan data. Dalam makalah ini, penulis menggunakan koleksi foto yang dibuat oleh Paul Piollet – seorang fotografer yang antusias yang melakukan perjalanan ke banyak tempat di Indonesia – sebagai suatu inventaris budaya dari kehidupan orang Indonesia Tionghoa. Dengan menggunakan teori dari bidang antropologi, penulis mendiskusikan bagaimana kehidupan orang Tionghoa Indonesia itu berbeda jauh dari stereotip orang Tionghoa yang ada di masyarakat pada masa Orde Baru dan yang sampai batas tertentu masih tetap ada di masyarakat. Penulis menunjukkan bagaimana foto-foto ini mendedahkan warna kehidupan orang Tionghoa di Indonesia yang tak terlihat, yaitu kehidupan yang tidak pernah dibayangkan oleh masyarakat Indonesia pada umumnya karena kehidupan orang Indonesia Tionghoa itu sama saja dengan kehidupan orang Indonesia pada umumnya.

## INTRODUCTION

For decades, anthropologists have been studying life narratives as a means of understanding cultures and societies. The making of life narratives as the object of anthropological studies is based on an assumption that “the life story of an individual who was somehow ‘representative’ of his or her culture would be illustrative of the way in which a ‘typical’ member of that group passed through the life cycle” (Angrosino, 1976:133). This assumption makes life narratives a tool for uncovering the ways people “struggle to constitute themselves as particular kinds of actors and persons vis-à-vis others within and against powerful sociopolitical and cultural worlds” (Skinner et al, 1998:5), and for understanding on how people shape the cultural worlds where they live.

Life narrative has also become a research interest in other fields of studies, especially within the social sciences, but the common method many fields of studies used for studying it has been ethnographic research technique. However, some scholars have proposed that photography and pictures can also be used as tools in doing the life narratives. This idea finds support in the field of visual anthropology, in which photo-elicitation techniques are mostly used in data collection.

At first, photographs were used for documentary purpose, that is, for documenting place, people, and events. This kind of photographs is usually “found” documents and quite common as forms of data in qualitative research (Bogdan and Biklen, 1982). The problem with photographs as “found” documents is that they are lack of context. Thus, they function as forms of evidence because they are “stand alone” sources and just seen as records. As forms of evidence, photographs are seen to have objectivity, that is, the situation depicted by the images in them is an accurate representation of the events. Underlining the camera’s ability to record events accurately, Collier and Collier in their book, *Visual Anthropology: Photography as Research Method* (1986), write that

The camera’s machinery allows us to see without fatigue; the last exposure is just as detailed as the first. The memory of the film replaces the notebook and ensures complete quotation under the most trying circumstances. The reliably repetitive operation of the camera allows for comparable observations of an event as many times as the needs of research demand. (1986:9)

In the development of the study of anthropology, the ability of camera to record things accurately is used for establishing cultural inventories. Photographic cultural inventories give people a great amount of detailed information for analysis. Combined with other elements such as context and commentaries, photographic cultural inventories are able to make factual narrative of their subjects.

In this paper, I use a collection of photographs taken from 1972 to 2001 by Paul Piollet – an enthusiast photographer who has travelled extensively in Indonesia – as a cultural inventory of the lives of Chinese Indonesians. This collection was published in 2014 as a book, entitled *The Unseen colors: Photographic Journeys into the Lives of Chinese Indonesians from 1972 to 2001*, by Center for Chinese Indonesian Studies, Petra Christian University, Surabaya, Indonesia. Drawing from the disciplines of anthropology, I discuss how the lives of Chinese Indonesians are far from the stereotypical portrayal of the Chinese, which was prevalent during the New Order era and to certain extent still exists today. I show how these photographs expose the “unseen colors” of the lives of the Chinese in Indonesia, that is, the lives that the Indonesian society may not relate to the Chinese because they are the everyday life of ordinary people in Indonesia.

## PHOTOGRAPHS AS CULTURAL INVENTORIES

When they go to the field, anthropologists hardly forget to bring camera, which serves as a “toolkit” in their fieldwork. The pictures they take provide information on the cultures and societies they studied. However, it has been in recent years that approaches to photographs and pictures are thought to enrich the anthropological understanding of societies and cultures. Before, photography was seen for

documentary purposes only. Shifts in paradigms of seeing photographs are due to changes concerning the value of photographs.

At first photographs were seen as essential works of art and documentation, namely, photographs were used for accurately describing places which are difficult to access, unknown people or events. However, in their development, people start to ask "what next?". This question is also propelled by the possibilities interpretative strategies offer in relation to photography as an ethnographic method. This happens because photographs carry signifying properties which could lead to different meaning in the connotative level, especially when photographs are placed in social space, which renders them in a state of flux. Images in photograph are fixed. However, the meaning they convey may change, dependent upon the cultural and historical locations of viewers, as well as the social and political contexts in which the subject of the photographs is situated. Seen from this perspective, photographs function as a form of visual communication laden with social, political, and cultural aspects. Factoring these aspects when they view photographs, people can grasp better what the photographs represent. In this way, they may comprehend the experiences the photographs tell, as well as the memories and emotions they evoke. Hence, photographs have dynamics in their social use (Strassler, 2010) and provide a productive way of thinking about the lives they picture (Pinney, 1998). Thus, photographs can give the subjects a voice to articulate their position, rather than providing an illustrative history. These contribute to the increasing recognition of photographs as ethnographic resources.

As ethnographic resources, photographs should not be separated from their contexts. They cannot be seen as images printed on paper. When photographers choose certain subjects, they must have intention or reason why those subjects are chosen. Surely there is meaning attached to the photographers' choices of their subjects. But that does not mean that the meaning of photographs is fixed. Photographs travel across time and space. In this process, the meaning behind them changes as they move from one context to another. Describing how photographs change the meaning attached to them, Elizabeth Edwards succinctly said that photographs are "a metaphor of power, having the ability to appropriate and decontextualize time and space and those who exist within it" (1992: 7). In other words, the power that photographs have is not in the images seen in the printed paper, but in their abilities to transform the hidden into the visible. Photographs, in this context, are not just passive and fixed images. Rather, they serve as the dynamic representation of reality because photographs have "the constitutive importance, agency, and affective qualities of things in social relations" (Edwards, 2012:222).

This dynamic representation leads photographs to being powerful. They are not just "snaps" because they go beyond what they replicate. They elucidate by providing vivid images of their subject, which can evoke emotion and trigger insights that might not be thought of before. In this way, photographs' semiotic signs, as seen in their dynamic representations of reality, should be viewed not only as a mode of replication or communication, but also as signs that can give "rise to and transform modalities of action and subjectivity regardless of whether they are interpreted" (Keane, 2005:186).

Using the idea that photography can function as an ethnographic method, that photography has the abilities to transform the hidden into the visible, and that photography can go beyond what the image replicate, I discuss how Paul Piollet's collection of photographs gives new insights on the lives of the Chinese in Indonesia.

### **"PHOTOGRAPHIC JOURNEY INTO THE LIVES OF CHINESE INDONESIANS"**

On Saturday, September 6, 2014, I went out to meet Rizal, an old friend of mine who is of Javanese ethnic background. Since I know that he likes photography, albeit amateurish, I brought Piollet's book because I wanted to show him the photographs Piollet took. It was interesting to see his reaction when he saw the two photographs below.



Singgarang, Riau, February 7, 1988 (p. 39).



Welahan, Central Java, 20 November 1983 (p. 32).

At first, there was nothing special in his reaction. However, when I told him that those houses belong to Chinese families, he expressed his disbelief. He said in Javanese, “*mosok tha?*”, which mean “no way!” in English. It was understandable that he did not think that Chinese families lived in those houses as there were no sign that Chinese families owned them. His disbelief was getting bigger when I showed similar pictures but this time, there was an inscription board (*biǎn'é*, 匾额) which indicated that the houses belonged to Chinese families, as seen in the two pictures below.



Tanjungbatu, South of Singkawang,  
West Kalimantan, 6 December 1991 (p. 45).



Belinyu, Bangka, 11 September 1982 (p. 19)

The images of houses in Singgarang, Welahan, Tanjungbatu, and Belinyu above are like any other ordinary houses in villages in Indonesia. However, what is special about them, namely, the thing that makes my friend surprised, is that those belong to Chinese families. People may wonder why the fact that they belong to Chinese families matters.

In his article, “Seeing through Pictures: The Anthropology of Photography,” Ruby writes that photography is “a culturally conditioned visual communication system amenable to ethnographic analysis” (1981:19). Viewed from this perspective, in studying photography, one should pay attention to context in which images are taken in order to understand their full meaning. The four pictures above provide a good example of how context helps us grasp the idea they reflect.

During the New Order era, the Chinese were described as an ethnic group that dominated Indonesian economy. Popular discourse on Chinese Indonesians was that they came to Indonesia as poor people, but after some time, they became successful businessmen, as a scholar formulated, “a personal career from rags to riches” (Sukisman, 1975:63-64). But their success stories do not reflect the reality, as



not all overseas Chinese are “the new emperors,” and those stories only highlight the bright side of the life of the successful overseas Chinese. Yet, the impact of the success stories is so great that they become the target of the social jealousy. In his book which was published in 1983, Coppel notes that the image of the Chinese Indonesians is that they were opportunistic group of people who often used dubious methods in their business because of their interest in money and oppressed the “real” Indonesians. Other ethnics in Indonesia often thought that the ethnic Chinese were rich because they exploited the former. This public perception conjured the image of the ethnic Chinese as an exclusive and rich people. *Reformasi* (the Reform) has indeed opened up opportunities for the Chinese to challenge the institutional discrimination and stereotypical portrayal, but they were unable to challenge their marginal position without articulating their interests as an ethnic minority. In their effort to do so, they tended to re-affirm the public stereotypes portraying them as an exclusive group.

In a fieldwork I did in 2004, one informant said that the Chinese “colonized” other ethnic groups economically and did not have social concern. This informant grew up in a remote village in East Java, and there was a Chinese shop owner whom he thought was very cruel. The Chinese lent the money to villagers and charged a very high interest. His experience taught him to think that the Chinese were rich by exploiting other people. Describing that the Chinese did not like mingling or having interaction with people outside their ethnic group and hence were considered exclusive, one informant shared his opinion.

When I was still a university student, there were some students of Chinese descent in my batch. But I don’t know them quite well. We rarely had any contact. What they did were, coming to school, going to classes, listening to the lectures, and then going home. As far as I know they never participated in any activities the students held. They prefer to get together with their fellow Chinese students. My interaction, as well as my *pribumi* friends’ interaction with was limited to academic matters. Although my friend and I tried to get them involved in our social circle, still they did not show any responses. They just like being together with other Chinese students. (Fieldnote, November 6, 2014)

In real life, people of other ethnicity could have the same attitude as that of the Chinese described by the two informants above. Yet, they associated that attitude with the Chinese. What my two informants above said showed that public opinion about Chinese Indonesians, that they were moneyed class and earned their wealth through exploiting other ethnic group still exists, although nowadays it is not as pervasive as it used to be.

With this social and historical background, viewers of the pictures of the houses above understand why the knowledge of who the owners of the houses matters. It matters because those pictures do not fit with the image of Chinese Indonesians, that is, being rich and exclusive. The houses in the pictures are like the houses that belong to Indonesians who are in the low-rank of the society. However, public opinion may not think that the Chinese could live in houses like them because those houses are not typical houses where the Chinese live. Rizal said, “I know that not all Chinese are rich. There are Chinese who are poor. However, I cannot imagine that there are Chinese living in houses as such.” Rizal’s statement reflects the stereotypical portrayal of the Chinese, which is still pervasive in Indonesian society. In this context, Piollet’s pictures refute the stereotypes of Chinese Indonesians and bring their real condition, which is like that of other ethnic groups, into the limelight. These pictures could give an awareness that not all Chinese belong to the rich class.

Besides the pictures of the houses above, the pictures below, which depict images of children, also reflect that the lives of Chinese Indonesians are like those of other ethnic groups.



Tanjung Pandan, Belitung, 11 May 1983 (p. 24)



Sungai Purun Kecil (Seliung), Pontianak, West Kalimantan, May 14, 1983 (p. 25)

These pictures show children of Chinese descent. Nothing distinguishes them from those from any other ethnic background, except perhaps their phenotypical features. As shown in the pictures, these children do not live in big and fancy houses. Instead, they live in an old wooden-walled and wooden-floored house, which looks like that it needs renovation. Even they do not have nannies that accompany them. In fact, an older sister has to take care of their younger sibling, as seen on the picture on the left. The picture on the right depicts two Chinese boys whose parents are farmers. It seems that they are helping their parents in farming the land. The lives of the children seen in the pictures above are definitely not like their co-ethnic peers who live in big cities such as Jakarta and Surabaya, many of whom, if not all, are from rich and middle class Chinese families.

Images of Chinese as moneyed class can also be seen in many prestigious private schools in big cities in Indonesia. Every morning when the school starts and afternoon when the school ends, people can see a lot of cars jam-packing streets around these schools. Many of these cars send and pick up student who comes from Chinese family background. Their drivers are mostly people of non-Chinese ethnicity, who serve as the guards of these Chinese students. Scenes as such prove that students who study there are definitely from well-to-do families. Describing his educational experience, a Chinese Indonesian coming from a well-to-do family in Jakarta says, "The natives go to public schools, which are cheap and the quality is not so good as the private schools where most of the Chinese send their children. I went to a private school where my classmates were all Chinese" (quoted in Djao, 2003:137). However, not all Chinese Indonesian students are like what Wei Djao's informant says. This can be seen in Paul Piollet's pictures below.



Merawang, Bangka, 7 September 1982



Pasuruan, East Java, 28 November 1992

The school in Merawang (Bangka) and Pasuruan (East Java) are far from the image of elite private schools which usually charge a very expensive tuition fee. Yet, people make a generalization that

Chinese students usually go to expensive private schools usually found in big cities across Indonesia. They overlook the fact that there Chinese students attending the schools like the ones in the pictures above. In the eyes of the public, Chinese students never ever go to this kind of school, where classes are conducted in a dilapidated building as in the case of the school in Merawang, or in the temple compound as in the case of the school in Pasuruan. Pilloet's two pictures here counter the stereotypical portrayal of the Chinese as a moneyed class. Chinese students depicted in these two pictures are like native students as described by Wei Djao's informant.

Piollet's other interesting pictures are the pictures of Chinese temples. As far as I know, there are almost no new Chinese temples in Indonesia. All temples – with the exception of Chinese Buddhist viharas – were built many years ago, despite undergoing renovation or facelift. There are temples which are still proper buildings, as seen in the following pictures.



Temple in Kampung Manggis, Jambi, December 7, 1992 (p. 99)



Rogojampi, East Java, December 2, 1995 (p. 99)

But there are those which are in a condition that seems to be relatively inappropriate for a religious building, if they are compared to other places of worship. The pictures below depict temples as such.



Panji, near Belinyu, Bangka, 11 September 1982 (p. 65)



Elaja Temple, Bintan Island, Batu 14, Jalan Gesek, Riau, 3 February 1988 (p. 89)

On Thursday, October 30, 2014, during a discussion on race and ethnicity in my *Asian Studies* class, I showed the picture of Elaja Temple above to my students, the majority of whom were of Chinese descent. I told them that the building was in Indonesia and asked them what building it was. All answered that it was a house in a village. When I asked them further about the ethnic background of the owner of that house, most answered that the owner was certainly a indigenous Indonesian. Out of 30 students, only three – all of them were Chinese – said that the owner was probably a Chinese Indonesian. The answer of these three students triggered my curiosity, so I asked them to explain why they thought that it belonged

to a Chinese Indonesian. One of them said that the discussion in class was about race and ethnicity, so my question about the ethnic background of the owner made them think that he or she was Chinese Indonesian because it was very rare to see a Chinese living in that kind of house. She said further that I would not use it as an illustration of race and ethnicity if the owner of the house was an indigenous Indonesian. She also explained that in a normal circumstance, she would not think that the house belonged to a Chinese Indonesian. Such an answer was another proof that many in Indonesian society, both the Chinese and the non-Chinese perceived the image of Chinese Indonesians as rich people. None of the students in my class would think that the owner was Chinese, so most were surprised when I told them that the owner was Chinese. They were even more surprised when I exposed to them that it was a Chinese temple and showed them the picture of a small temple in Sungai Pangkalan (see the photograph above). Another student who was of Javanese ethnic background commented that he never thought that there was such a Chinese temple. He elaborated further that he did not expect that a Chinese temple was like a luxurious place of worship, but definitely he also did not expect that it was like a building in a poor condition as such. Their surprise continued when I showed them Piollet's other photographs (see those pictures in previous pages). One student who was from Spain said that it never occurred to him to see living condition and properties of Chinese Indonesians like those photographs exposed. When I asked him what he thought of the Chinese in Indonesia, this Spaniard student said that based on the information he got from the books he read and his experiences in living Surabaya for more than two years and visiting big cities such as Jakarta, he thought that Chinese Indonesians belonged to middle and upper class. That was why he said that he was surprised to know that the lives of Chinese Indonesians, as depicted by Piollet's pictures, were not like what he thought before.

The people's reaction toward Piollet's photographs as I discuss above reflects the perception of the society toward the Chinese. It is a result of the legacy of the past where there was much distrust between the Chinese and the non-Chinese. This perception is based on prejudice and stereotype, which are founded on inadequate evidence. In this case, the Chinese are often seen as an exclusive group, rich people, and economic animals. The prejudice and stereotype are the results of the government's effort that focuses on the economic development without thinking of equal distribution of economic pie. This is exacerbated by the opinion that ethnic Chinese dominated the Indonesian economy. This opinion may hide the fact that although ethnic Chinese dominates Indonesian economy, those are a handful of Chinese who are close to the bureaucracy, as much more Chinese have to work hard to make ends meet. Nevertheless, there are also people – some are Chinese, and some are non-Chinese – who said that they were aware of the situation exposed in these pictures because they lived in that kind environment. However, their number is very minuscule compare to those who never imagine that there are Chinese Indonesians experiencing that kind of life.

Seen from the context, Piollet's photographs expose "the unseen colors" of the lives of Chinese Indonesians. The lives captured in these photographs are the lives of ordinary Chinese Indonesians who do not belong to the rich category, the lives that may have been neglected because they are part and parcel of the daily life in Indonesia. This situation leads the society to overlooking it. These photographs are also able to expose various nuances of life of the Chinese in Indonesia, the life that Indonesian society may not identify with the Chinese, as it is weaved tightly into the life of the society itself, and the exposure to various nuances of life enable the viewers of these photographs to understand the history and the trajectories of Chinese Indonesians.

## CONCLUSION

Although photography was originally used for documentary purposes only, it has the potentials for being used as a tool in ethnographic studies. Photographs, as the product of photography, can serve as a life narrative that provides a new perspective. They are also able to give new information or to change people's point of view on the photographs picture. All these happen because photography can introduce different voices into the images it captures.

Paul Piollet's collection of photographs that depicts images of the lives of Chinese Indonesians provides materials that function as an eye-opener for Indonesian society. It gives a startling revelation on



the lives of Chinese Indonesians that many do not imagine, as seen in the opinions of various people I discuss above. As Piollett himself writes, "The photographs presented in this book ... record the lives of the Chinese in Indonesia. They are ordinary Chinese and live in their surroundings whose lives may be forgotten without preserving them" (2014:7). It is the ordinariness that makes Chinese Indonesians' lives pictured in his photographs thought-provoking because they challenge the prejudice and stereotypes of Chinese Indonesians, that is, the prejudice and stereotypes that lead them to experiencing racial and discriminatory practices. This ordinariness is something Indonesian society rarely see, or even think about.

## REFERENCES

- Angrosino, M., 1976, "The Use of Autobiography as 'Life History': The Case of Albert Gomes" *Ethos*. Vol. 4. No. 2. pp. 133-154.
- Bogdan, R., and Biklen, S. K., 1982, *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theory and Methods*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Collier, J., and Collier, M., 1986, *Visual Anthropology: Photography as Research Method*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.
- Coppel, C., 1983, *Indonesian Chinese in Crisis*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Djao, Wei. 2003. *Being Chinese: Voices from Diaspora*. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press.
- Edwards, E., 1992, "Introduction." *Anthropology and Photography, 1860-1920*. New Haven: Yale University Press. pp. 3-17.
- . 2012. "Objects of Affect: Photography beyond the Image." *Annual Review of Anthropology*. Vol. 41. pp. 221-234.
- Pinney, C., 1998, *Camera Indica: The Social Life of Indian Photographs*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Piollet, P., 2014, *The Unseen colors: Photographic Journeys into the Lives of Chinese Indonesians from 1972 to 2001*. Surabaya: Center for Chinese Indonesian Studies, Petra Christian University.
- Ruby, Jay. 1981. "Seeing through Pictures: The Anthropology of Photography." *Camera Lucida*. Vol. 3. pp. 19-32
- Strassler, K., 2010, *Refracted Visions: Popular Photography and National Modernity In Java*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press
- Skinner, D., et al., 1998, *Selves in Time and Place: Identities, Experience, and History in Nepal*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Sukisman, W. D. 1975. *Masalah Cina di Indonesia [Chinese problems in Indonesia]*. Jakarta: Yayasan Penelitian Masalah Asia.