Humanising Language Teaching

Promoting Meaningful Learning in the Age of Artificial Intelligence

• Flora Debora Floris, Indonesia

Flora Debora Floris is an associate professor at the English Department of Petra Christian University, Indonesia. Her academic interests include language teacher professional development, the integration of technology in language learning, and the study of English as an international language. Her publications appear in both academic journals and teaching magazines, reflecting her commitment to bridging theory and practice in language education.

Email: <u>debora@petra.ac.id</u>

Abstract

This paper presents ten practical classroom activities to address Artificial Intelligence (AI) over-reliance. Grounded in literary texts, these activities foster essential human skills such as reasoning, creativity, and higher-order thinking, reducing dependency on AI and ensuring meaningful educational experiences.

Introduction

Artificial intelligence (AI) has become an increasingly valuable tool in education, particularly in tasks requiring written assessments. It can assist students in generating ideas, conducting literature reviews, offering suggestions for structuring, and improving grammar and vocabulary (Yasin & AL-Hamad, 2023). Al tools can significantly enhance the writing process. However, the growing reliance on AI also raises concerns. Overuse of these tools can hinder critical thinking and creativity, leading students to produce work that lacks originality, authentic author voice, and ethical consideration (Praphan & Praphan, 2023).

One response to these concerns has been the development of AI detection tools such as GPTZero, Crossplag, or AICheatCheck, designed to help teachers verify the authenticity of student work in written assessments. However, these tools are not always reliable. The study by Weber-Wulff et al. (2023) found that AI detection tools are generally unreliable, with significant misclassification issues, particularly when AI-generated text is paraphrased by machines. The study by Elkhatat et al. (2023) also found that current AI detection tools are more effective at identifying text generated by older AI models, such as ChatGPT Model 3.5, but struggle with newer models like ChatGPT Model 4. Additionally, the tools showed inconsistencies in accurately distinguishing between human and AI-generated text. These findings reveal significant limitations in current detection tools and the risks of misuse in academic contexts.

Basic principles

Instead of focusing only on detecting Al use, it is more effective to design tasks that reduce reliance on Al and build critical thinking, creativity, and originality. Teachers can create activities that emphasize human skills and values, preparing their students to navigate effectively and responsibly in an Al-driven world. Such activities should be based on the following basic principles:

Principle #1. Sustained Engagement and Progressive Development

Al excels at generating polished outputs quickly but struggles with tasks that require sustained effort and incremental growth. Milestone-Based Assessment is one approach that effectively leverages this limitation. Tasks are broken into stages, evaluated at multiple points throughout a semester (Orban, 2023). This method provides students with continuous feedback,

Activity #1. Multimedia Literary Analysis

Students will create a multimedia presentation analyzing a theme, character, or literary device in a selected text, using a combination of visuals, audio, and text to enhance their analysis. For example, a student might explore symbolism in The Great Gatsby, examining how the green light and the Valley of Ashes reflect themes of ambition and moral decay, or analyze irony in Romeo and Juliet, showing how it influences the perception of fate. A reflective piece will accompany the presentation, explaining the creative process and the rationale for integrating specific media elements. For instance, a student analyzing ambition in Macbeth could include visuals like a timeline of key decisions with symbolic imagery, audio clips of dramatic readings to highlight tone, and quotes with commentary on Shakespeare's language.

Rationale

This task fosters sustained engagement by requiring students to plan, research, and refine their presentations through a process that includes continuous feedback for improvement. The multimedia format encourages creativity and originality, as students integrate visual, auditory, and textual elements to enhance their analysis. The task develops higher-order thinking skills, such as analysis, evaluation, and creation, aligning with Bloom's Taxonomy. It also broadens students' understanding by exposing them to diverse perspectives and cultural contexts, resisting Al's tendency to standardize analysis. The reflective component further deepens learning by fostering ethical reasoning and emotional intelligence, as students evaluate their creative decisions and consider their impact on audience understanding. While Al can assist with generating text-based analyses, it struggles with tasks requiring multimedia integration and reflective reasoning. This activity demands originality, creativity, and critical thinking, which require sustained effort and meaningful engagement with minimal Al reliance.

Activity #2. Literary Debate

Students are assigned to have a debate about different meanings of a text's themes or author's purpose. For instance, they may discuss if Katniss Everdeen critiques performative activism in The Hunger Games. They might also analyze whether Killmonger is a villain or a tragic anti-hero in Black Panther due to systemic injustice. To prepare the debate, students need to create outlines with evidence, key arguments, and counterarguments. In the debate, they share their opinions, interact with other views, and reply to questions or comments immediately. They can use videos or images to support their ideas and make the debate more interesting. After the debate, students are asked to write a reflective essay on their performance, discussing how their views evolved, and analyzing the strength of their evidence and reasoning. This reflection encourages deeper engagement with the topic and self-assessment of their critical thinking skills.

Rationale

This task fosters ongoing development through preparation, debate, and reflection, with feedback integrated at each stage to encourage active participation and reduce reliance on Al. The debate format enhances creativity, critical thinking, and adaptability, while the use of multimedia tools such as videos or infographics inspires innovative and engaging presentations. By requiring logical argumentation and the synthesis of ideas, the task aligns with higher-order thinking skills as outlined in Bloom's Taxonomy. The activity also promotes diverse perspectives and cultural understanding by examining themes such as activism and injustice. Debating Killmonger's actions in Black Panther, for example, allows students to analyze social influences and engage in discussions about systemic inequality. Ethical reasoning and emotional intelligence are further developed as students confront moral dilemmas and emotional issues within their arguments. Reflective writing strengthens self-awareness and deepens students' ethical understanding by encouraging them to evaluate their performance and reasoning. While Al can generate basic arguments, it cannot replicate the spontaneity, critical thinking, and responsiveness required in live debates. The task's reliance on real-time interaction and adaptability ensures authenticity and originality. By integrating interactive engagement, continuous effort, and emotional involvement, this activity promotes meaningful learning and minimizes dependence on Al tools.

genre transformation, it lacks the nuanced understanding and creativity required for meaningful storytelling. This task ensures authentic learning and skill development, reducing over-reliance on Al tools.

Activity #10. Analytical Narrative Reflection

The activity is divided into three clear stages. First, students begin with exploration and planning, where they identify a central theme from an Indonesian text, such as resilience in The Rainbow Troops by Andrea Hirata or generational trauma in Beauty is a Wound by Eka Kurniawan. They reflect on how this theme connects to their personal experiences or cultural background, Next, students draft their narratives, integrating textual evidence to highlight parallels between the text and their personal experiences. Feedback from peers or teachers is used to refine their work. Finally, students present a reflective oral presentation, sharing their narratives and discussing how the theme shaped their understanding of both the text and their personal experiences.

Rationale

This task aligns with key principles while minimizing reliance on AI. It fosters sustained engagement through a staged process of planning, drafting, revising, and presenting, ensuring continuous improvement and authentic engagement. Students develop ethical reasoning and emotional intelligence by reflecting on personal experiences and connecting them to complex themes in literature, such as resilience or trauma. Higher-order thinking skills are enhanced as students analyze the text, evaluate its themes, and synthesize these insights into narratives and presentations. Students also engage with diverse perspectives and cultural contexts, linking societal and historical dynamics in texts such as The Rainbow Troops or Beauty is a Wound to their own cultural backgrounds and experiences. The reflective component and oral presentation encourage creativity and originality, as students articulate personal interpretations and connect the text's themes to their lived experiences. While AI may assist with generic narratives, it cannot replicate the integration of personal insight, emotional depth, and cultural nuance required for this task.

Conclusion

The use of AI in education offers many benefits but also raises concerns about over-reliance and its impact on critical thinking, creativity, and originality. To address these challenges, tasks must emphasize human skills such as ethical reasoning, diverse perspectives, and higher-order thinking. The suggested activities, focusing on literary texts, demonstrate how thoughtfully designed tasks can engage students in meaningful learning while reducing reliance on AI. By fostering skills like analysis, synthesis, and personal reflection, these activities ensure authentic learning experiences that AI cannot replicate.

References

Elim, E. H. S. Y. (2024). Promoting cognitive skills in Al-supported learning environments: The integration of Bloom's Taxonomy. *Education 3-13*, 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1080/03004279.2024.2332469

Elkhatat, A. M., Elsaid, K., & Almeer, S. (2023). Evaluating the efficacy of Al content detection tools in differentiating between human and Al-generated text. *International Journal for Educational Integrity*, *19*(1), 17.

Lee, S.-E. (2023). Otherwise than teaching by artificial intelligence. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, *57*(2), 553–570. https://doi.org/10.1093/jopedu/qhad019

Orban, L. L. (2023). *Teaching-mode agnostic, execution oriented, cheating and AI (ChatGPT) resistant written assignment assessment method*. Center for Open Science. http://dx.doi.org/10.31234/osf.io/m8y3a

Praphan, P. W., & Praphan, K. (2023). Al technologies in the ESL/EFL writing classroom: The villain or the champion?. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 62, 101072.

Rashid, B. T., & Hasan, M. N. (2020). The significance of literary texts in the pedagogy of English language in EFL and ESL classrooms. *UKH Journal of Social Sciences*, *4*(2), 22–27.